Chapter – III (ii) Animal Husbandry Department

1. Service/Cadre:-Posts:- Rajasthan Animal Husbandry Service Veterinary Officer, Senior Veterinary Officer

- 2. Representation from:-
- (i) Rajasthan Veterinary Association
- (ii) Rajasthan Pashu Chikitsak Sangh

Demand:-

They have represented that:

- (i) Veterinary Doctors have been given pay and allowances identical to Doctors of Medical & Health Services at entry level but at the senior levels, officer's pay scales have not been revised. Therefore, pay scales of Senior Veterinary Officer and other higher posts should be at par with similar positions in Medical & Health Department.
- (ii) Grade pays of the posts of Veterinary cadre are different from grade pays of Medical & Health Service. This has caused a loss of Rs.2000/-per month, although they are in the same Pay Band.
- (iii) Posts of Senior Veterinary Officer and Assistant Director, Animal Husbandry have been made equivalent and interchangeable in RCS (Revised Pay) Rules 2008. This has reduced their promotion avenues.
- (iv) Risk Allowance / Risk Insurance, Rural Allowance, Transport Allowance, NPA to Veterinary Officer be sanctioned at par with Medical Doctors.
- (v) In State Service s, first promotion is from Rs.8000-13500 to Rs.10000-15200, whereas in Veterinary Service, first promotion (from Veterinary Officer to Senior Veterinary Officer) is in Rs.9000-14400. It should be Rs.10000-15200, as in other State Service s.
- (vi) 5th & 6th Pay Commissions have recommended parity of Veterinary Officers with General Duty Medical Officers and Dental Doctors. This should be accepted, as qualifications, entrance-test, duration of course, registration and recruitment procedure for Veterinary & Medical Doctors are the same, but pay scales are different.
- (vii) No. of affected persons are:
 - 1. Veterinary Officers 1729
 - 2. Senior Veterinary Officers 337

सहायक का प्राप्त अधिक विता (विकास विकास शासन प्राप्तिक का अभिनेत

4. Factual Position and views of the Committee :-

I - Factual Position

(i) Pay Scales in RCS (Revised Pay) Rules 1998 and in RCS (Revised Pay) Rule 2008 for various officers in Medical & Health Department and Animal Husbandry Department are as follows:-

| Anim | Animal Husbandry Department | | | Medical & Health Department. | | | |
|--|---|-----------------------|--------------|---|---|-----------------------|--------------|
| Post | RCS RCS (Revised Pay) (Revised Rules 2008 Pay Scale | | Post | RCS (Revised Pay) Rules | RCS (Revised Pay) Rules 2008 Pay Scale | | |
| | Pay) Rules 1998 Pay Scale | Running Pay Band | Grade Pay | | 1998 Pay Scale | Running Pay Band | Grade Pay |
| Veterinary Officer | 8000-13500 | 15600-39100 (PB-3) | 5400 | Medical Officer | 8000-13500 | 15600-39100 (PB-3) | 5400 |
| Senior Veterinary Officer | 8000-13500 | 15600-39100 (PB-3) | 6000 * | Senior Medical Officer/ Dy. CMHO | 10000-15200 | 15600-39100 (PB-3) | 6600 |
| Assistant Director | 9000-14400 | 15600-39100 (PB-3) | 6000 * | Assistant Director | 10000-15200 | 15600-39100 (PB-3) | 6600 |
| Assistant Director/ Principal Training School / Survey and Investigation Officer | 9000-14400 | 15600-39100 (PB-3) | 6000 | Assistant Director | 10000-15200 | 15600-39100 (PB-3) | 6600 |
| Deputy Director | 10000-15200 | 15600-39100 (PB-3) | 6600 | CMHO/ Deputy Director/ Deputy Superintendent/ Additional CMHO | 12000-16500 | 15600-39100 (PB-3) | 7600 |
| Joint Director | 12000-16500 | 15600-39100 (PB-3) | 7600 | Joint Director | 13500-17500 | 15600-39100 (PB-3) | 8200 |
| Additional Director | 13500-17500 | 15600-39100 (PB-3) | 8200 | Additional Director | 14300-18300 | 37400-67006 (PB-4) | 8700 |
| Director | 14300-18300 | 37400-67000 (PB-4) | 8700 | Director | 16400-20000 | 37400-67000 (PB-4) | 8900 |

(ii) In this regard, 6th Central Pay Commission recommendations read as below:-

"3.8.25 The Fifth CPC had extended parity with General Duty Medical Officers and Dental Doctors to the post of Veterinary Officers requiring a degree of B.V. Sc. L.A.H. along with registration in the Veterinary Council of India. This parity is justified and may need to be continued".

(iii) Specified functionaries of Rajasthan Medical Service (Collegiate Branch) and Rajasthan Medical & Health Service (General Branch) are in receipt of Non Practicing Allowance at rate of 20% of the basic pay i.e., the sum of pay in the running pay band and grade pay thereon. The Non Practicing Allowance is not payable to Veterinary Officers.

िंग्रा प्राप्ति राविष सहायक शासन राविष वित्त (नियन) विभाग शासन सविवालय, जयपुर

II - Views of the Committee

(iv) It would be revealed from the comparison made in the factual report, that though the existing entry scale in both the services has been identical the same is not the case at the higher levels. The pay scales at the higher level in Medical Department do not match with the pay scales at higher level in the Veterinary Department. Veterinary Officers with bachelors degree are treated at par with General Duty Medical Officers and both the posts at entry level carry the same pay scale of Rs. 8000-13500 grade pay Rs. 5400/-. Yet it is a well understood fact that specialization and super specialization in the field of Veterinary Science at par with Medical Sciences is yet to establish itself fully. Apparently more research and specialization has taken place in Medical Sciences than Veterinary Sciences. Thus, the specialities in Medical Science cannot be compared with the specialties of Veterinary Science and as such, there is no comparison above, as claimed by the Association.

(v) The comparison beyond the level of General Duty Medical Officers by the Veterinary Association is neither fair nor justified. At present Animal Husbandry Department has parity of scales with Agriculture Department. It is also a fact that at one time Animal Husbandry Department was a part of Agriculture Department. The comparison of Animal Husbandry is therefore with Agriculture Department as would be clear from the table below:

| Animal Husbandry Department | Agriculture Department |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------|
| Assistant Director | Assistant Director |
| (Pay Scale 9000-14400) | (Pay Scale 9000-14400) |
| Deputy Director | Deputy Director |
| (Pay Scale 10000-15200) | (Pay Scale 10000-15200) |
| Joint Director | Joint Director |
| (Pay Scale 12000-16500) | (Pay Scale 12000-16500) |
| Director | Director |
| (Pay Scale 14300-18300) | (Pay Scale 14300-18300) |

- (vi) It would thus be seen that Animal Husbandry Service has enjoyed parity with Agriculture Department in respect of parity in scales.
- (vii) As regards making the posts of Senior Veterinary Officers and Assistant Director interchangeable, both posts being in the same scale of Rs. 9000-14400, this would not put Veterinary Officers to any financial loss in view of the of Assured Career Progression Scheme conferring benefits of the next grade pay on completion of 10, 20 and 30 years of service respectively. The dispensation of Assured Career Progression adequately addresses the problem of stagnation in any State or Subordinate Service now.
- (viii) The demand of the Veterinarians for grant of Non Practicing Allowance as is being granted to non-clinical posts in Medical Department, has no rational basis as private practice has not been banned in the Veterinary Department.

वित्त (नियम) विभाग शासन संचिवालय, जयपुर Animal Husbandry Department

1. Service/Cadre:-Posts:- Rajasthan Animal Husbandry Sub-ordinate Service Live Stock Assistant, Veterinary Assistant, Assistant Information Officer (Technical)

2. Representation from:-

Rajasthan Veterinary Services Federation

3. Demand:-

They have represented that:-

- (i) Recommendations of Sixth Central Pay Commission have not been implemented in the State at par with Central Government. This has resulted in lesser pay to Livestock Assistants, Veterinary Assistants, Assistant Information Officer (Technical).
- (ii) They have demanded following grade pays:

| Post | Existing Running Pay Band and Grade Pay | | Running Pay Band and Grade Pay demanded | |
|--|---|------|---|------|
| Live Stock Assistant | 5200-20200 (PB-1) | 2400 | 9300-34800 (PB-2) | 4200 |
| Veterinary Assistant | 9300-34800 (PB-2) | 3200 | 9300-34800 (PB-2) | 4600 |
| Assistant Information Officer (Technical) | 9300-34800 (PB-2) | 3600 | 9300-34800 (PB-2) | 4800 |

- (iii) They have demanded Risk Allowance.
- (iv) They have also demanded third selection grade for existing employees in pay scale of Rs.6500-10500 and that they be given grade pay of Rs.5400 under ACP.
- (v) No. of affected persons are -
 - L Live Stock Assistant is 3860
 - 2. Veterinary Assistant is 915
 - 3. Assistant Information Officer (Tech) is 1
- 4. Factual position and views of the Committee :-

I - Factual Position

(i) Pay Scales in RCS (Revised Pay) Rules 1998 and in RCS (Revised Pay) Rules 2008 are as follows:-

| Post | RCS (Revised Pay) | • | RCS (Revised Pay) Rules 2008 Pay Scales | | Central Civil Services (Revised Pay) Rules 2008 Government Scale | |
|---|-----------------------------|----------------------|--|----------------------|--|--|
| | Rules 1998 Pay Scales | Running Pay Band | Grade Pay | Running Pay Band | Grade Pay | |
| Live Stock Assistant | 4000-6000 | 5200-20200 (PB-1) | 2400 | 5200-20200 (PB-1) | 2400 | |
| Veterinary Assistant/ Senior Live Stock Inspector | 5000-8000 | 9300-34800 (PB-2) | 3200 | 9300-34800 (PB-2) | 4200 | |
| Assistant Information Officer (Technical) | 5500-9000 | 9300-34800 (PB-2) | 3600 | 9300-34800 (PB-2) | 4200 | |

हिर्चिक शास्त सायव विता (नियम) विभाग सम्बन्धालय, जयपु

-63-

(ii) Central Government have granted grade pay of Rs.4200 to those drawing pay in the pay scales Rs.5000-8000 and Rs.5500-9000, and not Rs.4600 as claimed by Director, Animal Husbandry. No Hazard Allowance has been sanctioned for any official in the State.

II - Views of the Committee

(iii) The demand of Veterinary Assistant for grant of pay at par with Govt. of India is not justified as the minimum qualification for this post in Govt. of India is graduate with biology, while in the State, the minimum qualification for this post it is Secondary. The post is not comparable on the basis of qualifications and nature of work, therefore any demand for higher pay scales at par with Government of India is untenable.

(iv) However, it would be pertinent to mention here that because of grant of higher grade pays to the holders of these pay scales i.e. Rs.5000-8000, Rs. 5500-9000 by the Committee, they would be benefited financially. This is being dealt with elsewhere in this report.

Animal Husbandry Department

1. Service/Cadre:-Posts:- Rajasthan Animal Husbandry Sub-ordinate Service Jaldhari/ Dresser/ Syeece/ Animal Attendant

2. Representation from:-

Rajasthan Pashupalan Sahayak Tukneekee Karmchari Sangh.

Demand :-

They have represented:-

- (i) That their pay scales (Pay Band & Grade Pay) in the Sixth Pay Rules are different from those of similar posts in Central Government.
- (ii) Central Government has upgraded the existing pay scales of Waterman, Dresser, Syecce, Cattle Attendant, Bull Attendant, Camel Attendant, and Laboratory Attendant. They have demanded upgraded pay scales at par with Central Government.
- (iii) They possess VIII Class educational qualification and are willing to acquire higher qualifications. They claim that their duties are arduous in nature.
- (iv) They have demanded parity with Central Government and that pay band PB-1 be granted to them.
- (v) No. of affected persons are :-

1. Jaldhari

- 724

2. Safai Karta

- 1395

3. Syeece Cattle Attendant, bull Attendant Shepherds -3142

4. Factual Position and views of the Committee:-

I - Factual Position

(i) The pay scales of these posts in RCS (Revised Pay) Rules 1998 and in RCS (Revised Pay) Rules 1998 (Revised Pay) Rules 2008 are as follows:-

| Post | RCS (Revised Pay) Rules | RCS (Revised Pay) Rules 2008 Pay Scale | | |
|------------------------------|----------------------------|---|--------------|--|
| | 1998 Pay Scale | Running Pay Band | Grade Pay | |
| Jaldhari/ Safaikarta | 2550-3200 | 4750-7440 (1S) | 1300 | |
| Syeece / Animal Attendant | 2610-3540 | 4750-7440 (1S) | 1400 | |

(ii) The method of recruitment, qualification for the following posts are as follows;-

| Post | Method of recruitment | Qualification |
|-------------------|-----------------------|--|
| Jaldhari/ Safai | 100% by Direct | 8 th Class Passed |
| Karta/ Shepherd | recruitment | |
| Syeece/ Cattle | 100% by | 8th Class Passed with 5 years |
| Attendant/ | Promotion | experience of regular service on posts |
| Shepherd/ Dresser | | of Jaldhari, Safai Karta, Shepherd are |
| Laboratory | | merged and re-designated as live stock |
| Attendant | L | attendant from 1.4.2001. |

प्रहायके शासन्य स्थित वित्त (नियम) विना-शासन सचिवालय, जयपुर (iii) The pay scale for Group 'D' Posts of All Para Veterinary Attendants in Central Government pay scale rules read as follows:-

| Post | Pay Scale |
|---------------|--|
| Group 'D' | All Group 'D' posts of Para Veterinary Attendants/ |
| posts of Para | Compounder are to be placed in the revised pay |
| Veterinary | band PB-1 along with grade pay of Rs.1800 after |
| Attendants | they are retrained suitably. |

The relevant part of 6th Central Pay Commission Report reads as under:-"2.2.9 While a separate running pay band, designated as IS scale, is being recommended for posts belonging to Group 'D', however, the same shall not be counted for any purpose as no future recruitment is to be made in this grade and all the present employees belonging to Group 'D' who possess the prescribed qualifications for entry level in Group 'C' will be placed in the Group 'C' running pay band straight away with effect from 1.1.2006. Other Group D' employees, who do not possess the prescribed qualifications, are to be retrained and thereafter upgraded and placed in Group 'C' running pay band. Till such time they are retrained and are redeployed, they will be placed in the -1S scale. The Commission clarifies that -1S pay scale is not a regular or a permanent pay scale. Insofar as the present employees are concerned, the scale will operate only till the time all the existing Group 'D' staff is placed in the Group 'C' running pay band. The exact mechanism for placing Group 'D' staff in the revised Group 'C' running pay band has been discussed in detail in chapter 3.7 relating to Group D staff. Group 'D' employees who are not placed in the Group 'C' pay band straightaway will be given the band after their retraining without any loss of seniority vis-à-vis those in Group 'D' who possessed higher qualifications, redeployed and were placed in the Group 'C' running pay band with effect from 1.1.2006. The retraining will also emphasize the multi-skilling of these employees so that one single employee is able to perform multiple jobs that hitherto were being done by many employees".

II - Views of the Committee

- (iv) The Association has demanded for grant of Pay Band and Grade Pay at par with Central Government employees.
- (v) In this context it would be appropriate to understand the observations of the Sixth Central Pay Commission. The Commission has recommended abolition of all Group-D posts of Para Veterinary Attendants and their placement in Pay Band-I after they are suitably retrained. The Commission has also recommended that all future recruitments in this grade will be banned, and till such time as these employees are retrained into multi-skilled employees, they are to remain in IS pay band.
- (vi) Animal husbandry being a core activity alongside Agriculture in Rajasthan, its importance and requirements have made it necessary that these ground level services for farmers are retained.
- (vii) It may be noted that last regular recruitment was made in 1992. There is therefore, very little scope of retraining the existing manpower

क्रिक्त प्राचन अस्तुर सासने सहितार्यक, अस्तुर to the level of competence of Compounders. In any case, with the passage of time most of them would have moved to higher pay. It is also necessary to read recommendations of upgradation in totality. The idea is to ensure delayering, encourage multi-skilling to provide for better services. The department should prepare a road map of qualifications, and a charter of duties. If such a scheme is prepared, openings can be provided to those who acquire qualifications of the level at which recruitment is proposed, but this should be subject to open competition and not for existing employees alone.

(viii) Keeping in view, the vast cattle population of the State and its importance in the rural economy the Committee feels that these services should be kept intact in its present form with the existing structure and scales. There is no reason therefore, for interference in the pay band and grade pay given to the holders of these posts.

 Service/Cadre:-Posts:- Animal Husbandry (Fisheries) Department

Rajasthan Animal Husbandry Sub-ordinate Service.

- i. Assistant Fisheries Development Officer.
- ii. Fisheries Development Officer.

Representation from:-

Demand:-

3.

Rajasthan Fisheries Association.

They have represented that: -

- (i) Prior to Fifth Pay Commission Rules there were two pay scales for the post of Assistant Fisheries Development Officer (AFDO), one for direct recruitees (in the scale of Rs.1640- 2900) and the other for promotes (in the pay scale of Rs.1400-2600). In Fifth Pay Commission Rules unified pay scale of Rs.5500-9000 was prescribed for both direct recruitees and promotes. Central Government had granted Rs.6500-10500 as Jr. Scale and Rs.7500-12000 as Senior Scale for the comparable post. Assistant Fisheries Development Officer gets promotion on the post of Fisheries Development Officer in the pay scale of Rs.8000-13500, but an AFDO gets his First Sclection grade in Rs.6500-10500 on completion of 9 years of Service, which is not justified.
- (ii) In other departments, posts equivalent to AFDO have been given PB-3 with grade pay of Rs.5400. Therefore, existing pay scale of AFDO should be up-graded to Rs.6500-10500 and then fixation of pay in 6th Pay Commission Rules should be done.
- (iii) Referring to the Court Judgment (in SBCWP no.4566/2004) Dt. 11-03-08, wherein Government was directed to decide their representation within six months, attention has been drawn to the fact contained in the representation from the Association that pay scale of the posts of AFDO, Lecturer, School Education and Senior P.A. were identical (Rs.550-1010) till 31-08-81. Subsequently, pay scales of the other two posts have been upgraded. The pay band and grade pays for the post of AFDO and other equivalent posts in Fisheries and those of Lecturer, School Education and Senior Personal Assistant are as under:

| Department | Post | RCS (Revised | RCS (Revised Pay) Rules 2008 Pay Scale | |
|-----------------|--|---------------------------------|---|--------------|
| | | Pay) Rules 1998 Pay Scale | Running Pay Band | Grade Pay |
| Fisheries | Assistant Fisheries Development Officer, Fisheries Research Assistant, Fisheries Extension Assistant, Lecturer, Fisheries Training School. | 5500-9000 | 9300-34800 (PB-2) | 3600 |
| Education | Lecturer, School Education | 6500-10500 | 9300-34800 (PB-2) | 4200 |
| Common Cadre | Senior Personnel Assistant | 6500-10500 | 9300-34800 (PB-2) | 4200 |

सहायक शासन सन्तिव वित्त (नियम) विसार शासन सचिवालय, जयपुर

- (iv) No. of affected persons are:
 - 1. Assistant Fisheries Development Officer 38
 - 2. Fisheries Development Officer 11

4. Factual Position and views of the Committee:-

I - Factual Position

- (i) Department has confirmed that representation submitted by Assistant Fisheries Development Officers with reference to the Hon'ble Court order was sent to Finance (Rules) Department. The Finance Department has regretted that comparison of pay scale of AFDO can not be made with that of School Lecturer and Senior Personal Assistant. The qualification of Assistant Fisheries Development Officer and equivalent posts i.e. (Senior Technical Assistant Fisheries) in the Central Government is M.Sc. (Zoology) and pay scale is Rs.5500-9000
- (ii) The pay band and grade pay of Assistant Fisheries Development Officer and Fisheries Development Officer in the RCS (Revised pay) Rules 1998 and RCS (Revised pay) Rules 2008 are as follows:

| Post | RCS (Revised Pay) | RCS (Revised Pay) Rules 2008 Pay Scale | | |
|---|-------------------------|---|--------------|--|
| | Rules 1998 Pay Scale | Running Pay Band | Grade Pay | |
| Assistant Fisheries Development Officer | 5500-9000 | 9300-34800 (PB-2) | 3600 | |
| Fisheries Development Officer | 8000-13500 | 15600-39100 (PB-3) | 5400 | |

(iii) The qualification and method of recruitment of Assistant Fisheries Development Officer and Fisheries Development Officer are as follows:-

| S. No. | Post | Method of recruitment | Qualification |
|-----------|--|--|--|
| 1. | Fisheries Inspector | 25% by Promotion | From Fieldsmen/Laboratory Assistant having 6 years experience. |
| | | 75% by Direct recruitment | Senior Higher Secondary or Higher Secondary in Science with Biology as one of the subjects from a recognised Institution or equivalent qualification. |
| 2. | Assistant Fisheries Development Officer (AFDO) | 25% by Promotion 75% by Direct recruitment | From Fisheries Inspector, 5 years experience on the post of Fisheries Inspector. M.Sc. (Zoology) with Fisheries as a Special paper or B. Sc. with Biology and 9 |
| 3. | Fisheries | 50% by Direct recruitment | months Training in Inland Fisheries. M.Sc. (Zoology) with Special paper in |
| Э. | Development Officer (FDO) | 50% by Direct rectainment | Fisheries or B.Sc. (Zoology) or equivalent. |
| | | 50% by Promotion | From AFDO having 5 years experience on posts – AFDO and equivalent post in subordinate service. |

-69-

- (iv) Prior to RCS (Revised Pay) Rules 1998 there were two pay scales viz. Rs.1640-2900 & Rs.1400 2600 for the post of AFDO. These pay scales were merged and a unified pay scale Rs.5500-9000 was given in RCS (Revised Pay) Rules 1998, which was the corresponding pay scale of Rs.1640-2900.
- (v) Selection Grades were extended as per rules. In case, there is no post for first, second or third promotion, as the case may be, in the same services/cadre, the first selection grade for the post carrying the pay scale of Rs.5500-9000 was Rs.6500-10500.
- (vi) In RCS (Revised Pay) Rules 2008, posts carrying existing pay scale of Rs.8000-13500 and above have been included in PB-3 (Rs.15600-39100). Pay of an existing employee, who was drawing this pay in the pay scale of Rs.8000-13500 (as selection grade) shall be fixed in PB-2 (Rs. 9300-34800), as per rules.

II - Views of the Committee

- (vii) We have examined the demands raised before us and have also gone through the pay scales prescribed in State Government and Govt, of India for similar posts.
- (viii) It would be pertinent to mention here that the post of Assistant Fisheries Development Officer cannot be compared with the posts existing in Govt. of India an account of two reasons. Firstly the designations of the posts are different and secondly the minimum qualification prescribed for the post of Assistant Fisheries Development Officer for direct recruitment is almost equivalent to the qualification fixed for Scientific Assistant in Govt. of India, which is also in the prerevised pay scale of Rs. 5500-9000.
- (ix) It is also a fact that in RCS (Revised Pay Scales) 1989 the pay scale of the post of Assistant Fisheries Development Officer was Rs. 1400-2360. While giving replacement scales in 1998, this post came to be equated with Lecturer, Fisheries Extension Assistant and pay scale of Rs. 5500-9000 was prescribed for the post of Assistant Fisheries Development Officer. While giving them replacement scale, a jump of one scale has already been given to Assistant Fisheries Development Officer.
- (x) In Agriculture Department the post of Assistant Agriculture Officer, Agriculture Extension Officer, Farm Managers who were earlier in the pay scale of Rs. 1640-2900 and Rs. 1400-2600 have also been given replacement scale of Rs. 5500-9000 in RCS (Revised Pay Scales) 1989. The parity and harmony in scales existing between Assistant Fisheries Development Officer and their counterparts in Agriculture Department is fair and need not be disturbed.
- (xi) As regard their contention for grant of Rs. 8000-13500 as first selection grade to Assistant Fisheries Development Officer, it would suffice to say that

now a new dispensation in the form of Assured Career Progression has been granted wherein every employee on completion of 10, 20 and 30 years or 9, 18 and 27 years of service, as the case may be, gets the benefit of next grade pay. Hence, the demand ceases to have any significance now.

- (xii) In the scheme of selection grades, in cases where there was no post for first, second or third promotion in the same service of cadre, for the post carrying pay scale of Rs. 5500-9000, the first selection grade granted was Rs. 6500-10500. Thus, there is no infirmity in grant of selection grades.
- (xiii) It is seen that there has been no recruitment in this department for a number of years. It would therefore be appropriate that a view should be taken on the structure and role of the department so that this feeling of stagnation amongst can be appropriately dealt with.
- (xiv) Comparison with departments such as Education, Secretariat has no relevance as the nature and scope of work are entirely different.
- (xv) Keeping in view the established parity scope of work and responsibility, the existing pay scales prescribed need to be retained without any modification.

 | The proof of the proof of